

Evaluation of the Effectiveness of the English Class Program at Al Ghozali Islamic Boarding School Using the Discrepancy Approach

Izzatun Illiyyin, Suwadi

Sunan Kalijaga State Islamic University Yogyakarta, Indonesia
24204092002@student.uin-suka.ac.id, suwadi@uin-suka.ac.id

Abstract: *This study aims to evaluate the effectiveness of the English Class Program at Al-Ghozali Islamic Boarding School using Provus' Discrepancy Evaluation Model (DEM). The evaluation focuses on the alignment between program standards and actual implementation across four main components: design, installation, process, and outcomes. This research employs a descriptive qualitative approach with a case study design. Data were collected through in-depth interviews, observation of learning activities, and documentation analysis, and were examined using Miles and Huberman's interactive analysis model supported by triangulation techniques to ensure data validity. The findings indicate that the program design was formulated comprehensively, and most standards were implemented during the installation stage, although documentation of competency standards and evaluation procedures had not been systematically organized. At the process stage, learning activities were conducted effectively through varied instructional methods and supported by pesantren-specific programs. At the outcome stage, the program contributed to improvements in students' speaking and listening skills, while reading skills and documentation of learning progress still required further strengthening. Overall, the English Class Program was considered effective and feasible to continue with several modifications, particularly in strengthening standard documentation, ensuring consistency in instructional processes, and optimizing the use of digital media. Despite being limited to a single pesantren context, this study provides an evaluative reference for the development and improvement of similar English Class programs and contributes to the theoretical discourse on program evaluation and foreign language learning management in Islamic boarding schools.*

Keywords: *Discrepancy Model, English Class, Islamic Boarding School*

Introduction

As the oldest Islamic educational institution in Indonesia, Islamic boarding schools have made a significant contribution to shaping a generation with character and competitiveness. To remain relevant, Islamic boarding schools must continue to adapt to the times and prepare students to face

global challenges¹. The development of science has also encouraged Islamic boarding schools to design curricula that not only focus on Islamic studies but also integrate other disciplines such as English and Arabic language teaching². Strengthening foreign language skills is important because these skills open up wider access to global scientific resources and international communication³. In addition, foreign language skills enable individuals to think more critically and creatively and to find various alternative solutions in social and academic life⁴.

The need to strengthen foreign language proficiency is increasingly urgent, given that the EF English Proficiency Index (2023) report shows that the English proficiency level of Indonesians is still relatively low, ranking 81st out of 113 countries⁵. This condition emphasizes the need to revitalize learning strategies, especially in Islamic boarding schools, in order to produce graduates who are competitive and adaptive to global changes. One form of adaptation is the strengthening of Arabic and English language learning through more modern teaching approaches and methods⁶. However, the low level of foreign language proficiency in various educational institutions, including Islamic boarding schools, shows the need for more contextual and effective learning innovations⁷.

¹ Zainollah and Ali Ridho, "Pendidikan Bahasa Asing Di Pondok Pesantren Mambaul Ulum Bata-Bata Pamekasan," *Kariman: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Keislaman* 09, no. Juni (2021): 85–102, <https://www.jurnalinkadha.org/index.php/kariman/article/view/172>.

² Nur Kholid, Doni Sastrawan, and Fuad Buntoro, "Problematisasi Interaksi Siswa Dalam Penggunaan Bahasa Arab Dan Inggris Di Pondok Pesantren," *JRPP: Jurnal Review Pendidikan Dan Pengajaran* 6, no. 4 (2023): 8–13. <https://doi.org/10.31004/jrpp.v6i4.19028>

³ Ema Umiatul Husna, Muhammad Anshori, and Khoirun Nisa', "Strategi Pembelajaran Program Bahasa Arab Dan Bahasa Inggris Untuk Meningkatkan Daya Saing Alumni Di Era Revolusi Industri 4.0 Di Pondok Pesantren Mambau's Sholihin Suci Manyar Gresik," *JoEMS (Journal of Education and Management Studies)* 4, no. 1 (2021): 51–58, <https://doi.org/10.32764/joems.v4i1.355>.

⁴ Mahfud Alizar, Tri Mulyanto, and Nuril Mufidah, "Manajemen Pengelolaan Lingkungan Berbahasa Arab Di Pondok Modern Daarul Abroor Banyuasin Sumatera Selatan," *Saliha: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Agama Islam* 6, no. 1 (2023): 61–78. <https://doi.org/10.54396/saliha.v6i1.470>

⁵ EF Education First, "EF English Proficiency Index 2023," 2023, https://www.ef.co.id/ept/?utm_source=com.

⁶ Wahyu Hanafi and Rizki Amalia Sholihah, "Politik Bahasa Asing Dan Hegemoni Pesantren Di Nusantara," *Journal of Arabic Language, Literature, and Education* 1, no. 1 (2020): 43–53. <https://doi.org/10.37680/aphorisme.v1i1.320>

⁷ Eliza Putri Ananda, "Daya Minat Dalam Penggunaan Bahasa Inggris Dan Pengaruhnya Terhadap Komunikasi Masyarakat Indonesia," *HYPOTHESIS: Multidisciplinary Journal Of Social Sciences* 1, no. 02 Juni (2023): 172–84, <https://azramedia-indonesia.azramediaindonesia.com/index.php/hypothesis/article/view/664>.

In response to this need, many Islamic boarding schools have begun to develop English classes as structured learning programs designed to intensively improve students' English communication skills. This program is part of efforts to modernize Islamic boarding school education by integrating foreign language learning into the curriculum, thereby preparing students to meet global demands. Various studies indicate that English programs in Islamic boarding schools not only serve to enhance linguistic competence but also build students' self-confidence and active communication skills. Furthermore, the existence of this program contributes to the development of human resources that are more competitive and adaptable in a global context. Thus, English language learning in Islamic boarding schools serves as a vital tool for enhancing graduates' competitiveness and broadening students' international perspectives.

A number of previous studies have shown that the implementation of English Class programs in various educational institutions still faces a number of challenges, requiring systematic evaluation. Evaluation of English language learning programs in elementary schools shows that although the learning process and student learning outcomes are fairly good, there are still weaknesses in program planning, curriculum, and educator competence that affect the achievement of learning objectives⁸. Evaluations at the secondary school level, including bilingual programs and special English classes, also reveal a gap between program standards and actual implementation due to variations in teacher quality, limited infrastructure, and a suboptimal program monitoring and evaluation system⁹. Meanwhile, research on the evaluation of English programs in universities and language institutions shows that although students have a positive attitude towards English Class programs, there are still discrepancies between learner needs, program design, learning methods, and the support services provided¹⁰. These findings emphasize that the existence of English Class programs needs to be accompanied by comprehensive evaluations so that the gap between planning, implementation, and learning outcomes can be minimized.

Nevertheless, previous studies have tended to focus on the implementation of learning and learning outcomes, without conducting a comprehensive and systematic evaluation of the program. Most studies have emphasized the effectiveness of teaching methods or improvements in

⁸ Laely Nuriyah, "Evaluasi Program Pembelajaran Bahasa Inggris Di Sekolah Dasar," *Jurnal Ilmiah Wahana Pendidikan* 7, no. 8 (2021): 397-405, <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.5773190>.

⁹ Aqilah Salsabila Rahman et al., "Evaluasi Pelaksanaan Program Bilingual Class SMP Islam Athirah," *Jurnal Pengabdian Masyarakat Bakti Negeri* 2, no. 1 (2025): 38-48, <https://doi.org/10.71277/rd613x86>.

¹⁰ Maria Puspa Sari, "An Evaluation of English Program: A Deep Analysis of Efl Learners' Attitude Towards English Program," *International Journal of Indonesian Education and Teaching* 5, no. 2 (2021): 133-47, <https://doi.org/10.24071/ijiet.v5i2.3245>.

students' language proficiency, while research that integrates program planning, implementation, and outcomes within a single evaluation framework remains limited. Furthermore, the use of evaluation models in the pesantren context is still dominated by descriptive approaches such as CIPP or Kirkpatrick, which emphasize a general overview of the program without specifically identifying gaps between planned standards and actual practices in the field¹¹.

On the other hand, gap-based evaluation approaches such as the Discrepancy Evaluation Model (DEM) hold great potential for identifying discrepancies between program standards and actual implementation. This model allows for systematic evaluation at every stage of the program—from design and implementation to process and outcomes—thereby providing more targeted recommendations for improvement. Several studies indicate that the use of DEM in an educational context can reveal the strengths and weaknesses of a program in detail through systematic gap analysis¹². However, the application of the DEM model in evaluating English language learning programs in Islamic boarding schools, particularly in boarding-school-based systems, remains very limited.

Based on the above discussion, there is a significant research gap: few studies have specifically evaluated English language learning programs in Islamic boarding schools using a systematic evaluation approach based on the Discrepancy Evaluation Model (DEM). Most studies have not thoroughly examined the alignment between program design, implementation, and outcomes achieved within an integrated evaluation framework. This limitation indicates the existence of conceptual and methodological gaps that need to be addressed through more comprehensive research based on gap analysis.

Therefore, this study aims to evaluate the English Class program at the Al-Ghozali Islamic Boarding School using the Discrepancy Evaluation Model (DEM) approach. Specifically, this study is designed to identify and analyze discrepancies at each stage of the program, including the design, implementation, process, and outcomes. Thus, this study not only describes the program's implementation but also provides a comprehensive analysis of the degree of alignment between program planning and implementation, and generates improvement recommendations based on empirical findings.

¹¹ Dhamar Widya Safitri and Edi Istiyono, "The Impacts of Zoning System Policies of New Students' Admission on the Education Quality Equalization," *Journal of Educational Research and Evaluation* 6, no. 3 (2022): 619–28, <https://doi.org/10.23887/jere.v6i4.52712>.

¹² Muhammad Nursa'ban and Mukminan, "The Implementation of Geography Learning with Spatial Representation Using the Discrepancy Evaluation Model," *REID (Research and Evaluation in Education)* 9, no. 1 (2023): 49–64, <https://doi.org/10.21831/reid.v9i1.53505>.

Furthermore, this study is expected to contribute to three aspects. Theoretically, this study enriches the body of research on program evaluation within the context of pesantren-based Islamic education. Methodologically, this study offers an evaluation approach based on systematic gap analysis in assessing language learning programs. Practically, the results of this study are expected to serve as a foundation for institutional administrators to continuously improve the quality of English Class programs and enhance the global competitiveness of graduates.

Method

This study employs a qualitative approach using a case study design to evaluate the implementation of the English Class program at Al-Ghozali Islamic Boarding School. This approach was chosen because it provides an in-depth understanding of the phenomenon under study in its natural context, particularly in identifying gaps between program planning and implementation. The research was conducted at the Al-Ghozali Islamic Boarding School, which integrates the English Class program as part of strengthening the students' foreign language competencies. Participants in this study were selected using purposive sampling, taking into account their direct involvement in the English Class program.

This study uses the Discrepancy Evaluation Model (DEM) as the primary evaluation framework to identify gaps between the ideal and actual conditions of the program. The evaluation was conducted across four main components: design, implementation, process, and outcomes. In the design aspect, the evaluation focused on the program's objectives, curriculum, and instructional planning, which were analyzed through documents and interviews with program administrators. In the implementation aspect, the evaluation emphasized resource readiness, such as teacher competencies and the availability of facilities and infrastructure. In the process aspect, the evaluation examined the delivery of instruction, the methods used, and the interaction between teachers and students through direct observation. Meanwhile, regarding the product aspect, the evaluation focused on student learning outcomes and English communication skills. A gap analysis was conducted by comparing the actual conditions observed in the field with the ideal standards established based on the principles of communicative language learning.

Data collection was conducted through in-depth interviews, observations, and a review of documents. Semi-structured interviews were conducted with all informants to gather information regarding the planning, implementation, and outcomes of the program¹³. Observations were conducted directly during English class activities. In addition, a review of

¹³ Sugiyono, *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, Dan RND*.

supporting documents was conducted, including learning assessments, attendance records, and student evaluation results.

Data analysis in this study utilized the interactive model proposed by Miles and Huberman, which comprises three stages: data reduction, data presentation, and drawing conclusions¹⁴. During the data reduction stage, data obtained from interviews, observations, and documentation were selected and focused based on the components of the DEM evaluation. Next, in the data presentation stage, the data were organized into categories and matrices to facilitate the analysis of the gap between ideal and actual conditions. The final stage involved drawing conclusions through systematic data interpretation, guided by the DEM framework. To ensure data validity, this study employed source triangulation and methodological triangulation techniques, specifically by comparing data obtained from various informants and utilizing diverse data collection methods. Additionally, member checking was conducted by confirming interview results with informants, and an audit trail was established to systematically document the entire research process.

Results and Discussion

Results

The findings indicate that the English Class Program at Pondok Pesantren Al-Ghozali has been systematically designed as a compulsory program for all students since their initial enrollment. The program, implemented in 2021, aims to develop students' soft skills, particularly English language proficiency, to support their academic and future professional needs. As stated by one of the program administrators: *"The English Class program is mandatory for all students and is designed to equip them with English language skills as essential soft skills."*

The program is structured into four levels – Basic, Intermediate, Upper-Intermediate, and Advanced – with each level conducted over two semesters. Given the four-year duration of students' residency, the program is designed to enable students to reach the Advanced level upon completion. Each level is supported by structured learning modules, and evaluation is conducted at the end of each semester through various forms, including presentations, written tests, listening tests, and speaking assessments.

However, the findings also reveal that although evaluation practices have been implemented, the evaluation standards have not yet been formally standardized and systematically documented. Indicators of program success remain implicit and are not explicitly formulated in official program documents. Thus, at the design stage, a discrepancy exists between the well-structured program planning and the absence of a comprehensive and standardized evaluation system.

¹⁴ Morgan, "Using Triangulation and Crystallization to Make Qualitative Studies Trustworthy and Rigorous." <https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2024.6071>

In terms of installation, the program is generally supported by adequate human resources and learning facilities. Tutors are recruited from alumni, student administrators, and external instructors, particularly from the university language center, with one tutor assigned to each class. Tutor selection emphasizes teaching ability rather than formal academic qualifications, indicating a flexible recruitment approach.

From the facilities' perspective, learning activities are conducted in available spaces such as halls and classrooms, supported by instructional media including modules, audio materials, Google Forms, and supplementary learning applications. Nevertheless, the findings indicate that the program has not yet been fully supported by a dedicated language laboratory as an optimal learning facility. In addition, structured and continuous professional development programs for tutors have not been systematically implemented. Therefore, a discrepancy is identified between the availability of supporting resources and the optimization of instructional facilities and teacher professional development.

At the process level, the findings show that the learning activities employ a variety of instructional methods, including grammar explanation, listening exercises using audio and digital platforms, pair-based speaking practice, and presentation-based activities. Supporting programs such as *Tafsir Jalanan*, conducted twice a week, and semester-based academic conferences further provide opportunities for students to actively use English in meaningful contexts. As noted by the program administrator: "*Students are not required to use English daily, but they are facilitated through activities such as Tafsir Jalanan and academic conferences.*"

However, the implementation process faces challenges related to time constraints and students' physical conditions. Classes are conducted at night after a full day of activities, which affects students' concentration and learning motivation. Thus, at the process stage, a discrepancy emerges between the planned interactive learning design and the actual learning conditions influenced by students' fatigue and limited instructional time.

At the product level, the findings demonstrate that the program contributes to improving students' English proficiency, particularly in speaking and presentation skills. This is reflected in students' increased confidence in public speaking, participation in academic presentations, and engagement in communicative activities.

At the Advanced level, students are prepared for institutional TOEFL tests, indicating alignment with long-term academic goals. However, the assessment system has not yet fully adopted standardized measurement instruments. Evaluation is primarily based on assignments, listening activities, and classroom performance, without consistent reference to standardized language proficiency benchmarks. Therefore, a discrepancy exists between observable learning outcomes and the absence of a standardized and objective assessment system.

Discussion

The Provus evaluation model emphasizes identifying discrepancies between standards and actual conditions in each part of a program. By mapping the gaps in each component, managers can determine necessary corrective actions to improve program implementation effectiveness and success¹⁵.

Program Design

The design stage in the *discrepancy* evaluation model focuses on assessing the suitability between the planned standards and the actual conditions of the program, particularly in terms of objectives, inputs, processes, and outputs ¹⁶. Based on the official standards of the Al-Ghozali Islamic Boarding School *English Class* Program, the program design has been systematically developed by setting clear and measurable objectives. These objectives include gradually improving the students' English language skills, equipping them with academic and everyday communication skills, strengthening their confidence in speaking English, and developing *soft skills* and language literacy through the use of digital learning applications.

In this design stage, the boarding school has also determined the program's audience, namely all students as mandatory participants, and prepared the implementing personnel consisting of tutors from among alumni, boarding school administrators, and teaching staff from outside the boarding school. In addition, various initial program support tools, such as learning modules for each level (*Basic-Advanced*), learning schedules, and evaluation provisions, have been formulated from the outset as part of the program design.

Furthermore, learning standards were formulated in detail, covering standards for participants, educators, materials, methods, evaluation, infrastructure, and class level structure. The program also set specific learning outcomes for each level, ranging from the ability to conduct simple conversations at the *Basic* level, the ability to understand texts and engage in light discussions at the *Intermediate* level, to the ability to give academic presentations and readiness to take the TOEFL test at the *Advanced* level. This design shows consistency between the program objectives and the needs of English language learning in the pesantren environment.

However, the evaluation results show a small gap, particularly in the aspect of the lack of a well-documented comprehensive evaluation standard. This gap has the potential to affect the accuracy of comprehensive learning

¹⁵ Yohanes Subasno, "Provus's Discrepancy Evaluation Model Pada Pendidikan Inklusi," *Jurnal Kataketik Dan Patoral* 3 (2018): 23-34, https://e-journal.stp-ipi.ac.id/index.php/sapa/article/view/53?utm_source.com.

¹⁶ Hestia Wandasari et al., "Evaluasi Program Kesetaraan Paket C Berbasis Model Provus Di PKBM Budi Utama," *Cendekia: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pemberdayaan Masyarakat* 2, no. 2 (2024), <https://journal.bayfapublisher.com/index.php/cendekia/article/view/68>.

achievement measurement, although it does not diminish the main strengths in the aspects of goal planning and program structure.

These findings are consistent with previous studies that applied the Discrepancy Evaluation Model in the context of differentiated learning, which showed that understanding and documenting the initial program plan are key factors in identifying gaps between standards and actual learning practices¹⁷. Other studies also confirm that the implementation of differentiated learning is greatly influenced by careful planning and the readiness of educators to adjust learning strategies based on initial assessments and student needs¹⁸.

Thus, the results in the field at the Al-Ghozali Islamic Boarding School English Class Program not only reflect a strong program planning structure, but also reinforce previous research findings that systematic program design and clear evaluation standard documentation are important factors in improving the quality and effectiveness of language learning program evaluation.

Program Installation

The installation stage in the Gap Evaluation Model aims to assess the extent to which the program is implemented in accordance with the design or standards set at the design stage. At this stage, evaluators carry out three main activities, namely reassessing program criteria, monitoring the initial implementation of the program, and examining the gap between the plan and actual implementation¹⁹. The evaluation results show that the English Class Program at Al-Ghozali Islamic Boarding School has generally been installed and implemented with a fairly good level of compliance with the formulated standards.

In terms of facilities and infrastructure, the boarding school has provided learning facilities as listed in the program standards, including learning rooms (upper hall, lower hall, and special classrooms), modules for each level, and supporting media such as *audio listening*, the use of Google

¹⁷ Irene Septinna Nugrahani and Yari Dwikurnaningsih, "Primary :Evaluating Teacher Performance in Implementing Differentiated Learning Using the Discrepancy Model," *Primary: Jurnal Pendidikan Guru Sekolah Dasar* 14, no. 3 (2025): 344-54, <https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.33578/jpfkip.v14i3.p344-354> Evaluating.

¹⁸ Kharisma Putri and Elizar, "Implementing a Differentiation Approach in Teaching to Accommodate Diverse Learning Styles Of Primary School Students : A Systematic Literature Review," *Journal for Lesson and Learning Studies* 8, no. 1 (2025): 119-28, <https://doi.org/10.23887/jlls.v8i1.89659>; Yuli Amaliyah and Panut Setiono, "The Implementation of Differentiated Learning Model for Primary School Students," *Jurnal Indonesia Pendidikan Profesi Guru* 1, no. 2 (2024): 73-80, <https://ojs.aeducia.org/index.php/jippg>.

¹⁹ Nurhadi et al., "Evaluasi Program Ekstrakurikuler Pramuka (Studi Evaluasi Discrepancy Evaluation Model Di Sekolah Menengah Pertama Islam Nurul Fikri Boarding School Serang)," *Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam* 4, no. 1 (2024): 27-50, <https://jurnal.staiq.ac.id/index.php/elmadrasa/article/view/86>.

Forms for formative evaluation, and the English Class application for independent practice and *listening practice*. However, one important component of the program design, namely the language laboratory, is not yet physically available. This situation has prompted the program to optimize the use of digital and audio media as alternatives to support receptive skills learning.

Dependence on digital and audio media as a substitute for conventional language laboratories is, in principle, in line with the latest research findings which show that the use of mobile-assisted and web-based tools is effective as an alternative to traditional language laboratories, particularly in improving listening skills and encouraging independent learning practices among students. A systematic review study by Álvarez Martínez et al. (2025) confirms that Mobile-Assisted Language Learning (MALL) has a positive impact on improving listening comprehension, learner autonomy, and learning flexibility, making it suitable for implementation in learning contexts with limited physical facilities²⁰. This finding is reinforced by Raj et al. (2024), who state that instructional mobile applications significantly improve students' listening comprehension²¹, as well as other studies showing that mobile technology can be a reliable alternative when conventional language laboratories are not available²². Thus, despite physical limitations, the implementation of learning media in this program can still be categorized as aligned with technology-based language learning standards.

In terms of education and management, the implementation of the English Class Program has been running according to the initial design. Tutors are assigned to each level of learning according to the needs of the program, with backgrounds ranging from Islamic boarding school alumni, administrators, and teachers from outside the boarding school. The recruitment of tutors does not require specific formal educational qualifications, but rather emphasizes English teaching skills. This pattern allows the program to continue running sustainably, despite the impact of variations in teaching quality between tutors. The program's management structure has also been established with a clear division of roles, where the teaching council functions as academic coordinators, student administrators

²⁰ Julio Antonio Álvarez Martínez, Juan Fernando Gómez, and Juan Carlos Restrepo Botero, "Mobile-Assisted Language Learning (MALL) for Improving English Language Teaching and Learning in Higher Education : A Systematic Literature Review," *Knowledge Management & E-Learning: An International Journal (KM&EL)* 17, no. 2 (2025): 258-77, <https://doi.org/10.34105/j.kmel.2025.17.012>.

²¹ Antony Raj and Prajeesh Tomy, "An Experimental Study on the Influence of Instructional Mobile Applications in Enhancing Listening Comprehension of Rural Students in India," *Frontiers in Education* 8 (2024): 1-13, <https://doi.org/10.3389/feduc.2023.1280868>.

²² Fauzul Etfita et al., "Pendampingan Pemanfaatan Mobile Assisted Language Learning (MALL) Untuk Meningkatkan Kemampuan Berbahasa Inggris," *Jurnal Abdidas* 6, no. 1 (2025): 97-106, <https://doi.org/10.31004/abdidas.v6i1.1113>.

handle technical aspects and infrastructure, while boarding school supervisors play a role in providing general policy guidance.

However, the evaluation results show that the academic monitoring and supervision process has not been carried out systematically and has not been supported by adequate documentation. This condition causes the assessment of learning outcomes to remain general and not fully measurable. These findings are in line with the research by Zahroh and Hilmiyati (2024), which confirms that weak documentation of competency standards and learning achievement indicators is one of the main factors contributing to the inaccuracy of competency-based education program evaluations²³. Without structured achievement documents for each level, program evaluation tends to rely solely on final results and is unable to comprehensively map the gaps between design, implementation, and learning outcomes.

Although most of the standard components have been implemented, the evaluation identified several administrative shortcomings: in particular, learning competency standards that have not been neatly documented and participant achievement assessments that rely more on semester report cards without formal achievement indicator documents per level. This kind of documentation gap hinders more measurable achievement assessments and the formulation of appropriate capacity building interventions. These findings support research on competency-based program implementation, which emphasizes that detailed documentation of competency standards and indicators is important to ensure alignment between design, implementation, and ongoing evaluation²⁴.

Thus, the implementation stage of the English Class Program at Al-Ghozali Islamic Boarding School can be categorized as good because the main components have been fulfilled, and the implementation is moving according to the initial design. However, improvements in the arrangement of competency standard documents and a routine supervision system are needed so that program implementation is truly in line with the design and facilitates continuous evaluation.

Product (Goal Measurement Stage)

The goal measurement stage in the Gap Evaluation Model focuses on assessing whether the designed program has successfully achieved its

²³ Fitri Lutfia Zahroh and Fitri Hilmiyati, "Indikator Keberhasilan Dalam Evaluasi Program Pendidikan," *Edu Cendikia: Jurnal Ilmiah Kependidikan* 4 (2024): 1052–63, <https://doi.org/10.47709/educendikia.v4i03>.

²⁴ Putri Zulfa Lestari, Rijal Amirulloh, and Dine Meigawati, "The Implementation of a Competency-Based Training Program at the Regional Technical Implementation Unit of the Job Training Center Dinas Tenaga Kerja Dan Transmigrasi Sukabumi Regency," *International Conference on Economics, Technology, Management, Accounting, Education, and Social Science* 01 (2025): 681–90, <https://conference.unita.ac.id/index.php/icetea/article/view/411>.

primary objectives through the analysis of learning achievement data and the determination of the level of outputs obtained. At this stage, the evaluator examines the extent to which the program's final outcomes align with the standards and objectives established during the design phase²⁵. Based on the research findings, the program's achievements, evident in the improvement of oral communication skills, indicate that the implemented learning approach has had a positive impact on the development of students' English language competencies. The predominant improvement in speaking and listening skills reflects the success of the communicative approach in building students' confidence and active language proficiency.

This finding is in line with several studies which show that the application of communicative language teaching and interactive learning approaches can significantly improve students' speaking skills and self-confidence in using English in Islamic boarding school and secondary school educational environments.²⁶ In addition, the analysis of literature on language pedagogy confirms that effective language skills development must include all four skills in a balanced manner.²⁷ The communicative approaches such as CLT combined with intensive learning strategies can strengthen reading skills, which are relevant to the need to improve literacy in English Class.²⁸

At the Advanced level, the implementation of internal TOEFL preparation demonstrates that the program has begun to move toward its long-term goal of preparing students for the academic demands of higher education. The basic TOEFL skills acquired by participants demonstrate that the program has partially achieved its goal of improving English language competency at the advanced level. Analysis of student achievement data shows that the speaking and listening components are the program's strongest outputs.

²⁵ Nurhadi et al.

²⁶ Leong and Ahmadi; Intan Trine Chodija, Taufik Rahman, and Rendi Irmawanto, "Improving English Speaking Skills Through the Communicative Language Teaching Method at Roudlotul Quran Islamic Boarding School, Metro City," *Member: Jurnal Inovasi Pengabdian Masyarakat* 2 (2023): 9-17, <https://doi.org/10.47902/member.v2i3.154>; Aqilah Salsabila Rahman et al., "Evaluation of the Implementation of the Bilingual Class Program at Athirah Islamic Middle School," *Jurnal Pengabdian Masyarakat Bakti Negeri* 2, no. 1 (2025): 38-48, <https://doi.org/10.71277/rd613x86>.

²⁷ Samson Dodzi Fenuku, "The Core Aspects of Effective Language Pedagogy: Listening, Speaking, Writing and Reading," *Journal of English Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics* 10, no. 2 (2024): 132-54, <https://doi.org/10.52657/js.v10i2.2345>.

²⁸ Tri Jampi Setiyorini, Yuyun Yulia, and Hasti Robiasih, "Communicative Language Teaching Method at Improving Students' Macro and Micro-Skills of Reading Comprehension in Intensive Reading Course," *EduLite: Journal of English Education, Literature and Culture* 7 (2022): 233-50, <https://dx.doi.org/10.30659/e.7.2.233-250>.

However, measurement results indicate that achievement in reading is still not as strong as the other two skills, while writing skills have developed quite well. This is because in addition to the writing exercises provided in the learning modules, writing is also strengthened through the Research Class Program, where students compile papers in English, providing a more comprehensive writing experience. This finding is also evident from classroom observations, which indicate that writing activities have taken place in a more structured manner, although variations may vary between classes. Furthermore, although summative evaluations such as the Final Semester Exam (UAS) have been implemented, documentation of learning progress in the form of progress reports has not been standardized, so periodic output analysis cannot be carried out consistently every semester.

Based on the overall findings, the objective measurement phase indicates that the English Class Program has successfully achieved most of its primary objectives, particularly in strengthening oral communication skills and increasing students' confidence in using English. However, more targeted improvements in written literacy and standardization of achievement reporting need to be prioritized to ensure that all language skills develop in a balanced manner and align with program standards.

Program Comparison

The program comparison stage is the final stage in the Gap Evaluation Model, which aims to match or compare the results achieved with the objectives and standards set in the design stage. At this stage, evaluators review all findings from the previous four stages: design, implementation, process, and outcome measurement and then identify gaps between the ideal conditions and the reality of implementation in the field. These gaps are then systematically compiled and submitted to decision-makers so that they can determine the continuation, modification, or improvement of the program²⁹.

The evaluation results show that the Al-Ghozali Islamic Boarding School English Class Program has generally been able to realize most of the standards formulated in the design stage. The program design is comprehensive, covering learning objectives, participant standards, level structure, educator standards, materials, methods, infrastructure, and evaluation. During the implementation phase, the majority of these components were successfully implemented, such as the provision of classrooms, learning modules for each level, audio media, *Google Forms*, and the English Class Application. However, some design elements have not been fully realized, such as the lack of a language laboratory. These findings are consistent with research on the evaluation of English language learning programs, which shows that the implementation of infrastructure and media

²⁹ Wandasari et al., "Evaluasi Program Kesenjangan Paket C Berbasis Model Provus Di PKBM Budi Utama." <https://journal.bayfapublisher.com/index.php/cendekia/article/view/68>

components greatly affects the effectiveness of learning in the classroom³⁰. This study supports research by Nuriyah (2021), which states that the provision of appropriate infrastructure and materials is an important foundation in evaluating English language learning programs to achieve students' communicative abilities³¹.

A comparison between the process standards and actual implementation shows that the learning methods have been applied according to plan with adequate method variations and supporting activities such as Tafsir Jalalain and English research presentations. However, gaps are still evident in the consistency of digital application use and the limitations of the immersive environment due to the lack of implementation of the *English Area* policy. These findings are in line with program evaluation research in the context of language institutions, which found that the variety of learning methods and consistency in their implementation affect the learning outcomes of program participants³². This study supports research by Arnoi & Pranowo (2020), which states that the use of varied learning methods and media contributes to the success of English language learning programs, but consistency in implementation needs to be considered in order to achieve optimal results³³.

The physical condition of students due to the night study schedule shows that there are operational obstacles that affect the effectiveness of learning, although this is not a design gap. This shows that the resource aspects of participants also affect the overall implementation of the program. This impression is supported by learning evaluation research which shows that external factors such as the condition of learning participants can significantly affect the success of achieving learning objectives. This research is in line with the findings of Nuriyah (2021), which emphasizes the need to pay attention to the context and conditions of participants in evaluating English learning programs³⁴.

At the outcome measurement stage, the program showed positive results based on semester reports used as the main assessment reference. In

³⁰ Arsyi Rizqia Amalia et al., "Analysis of the Use and Suitability of English Teaching Materials and Media in Elementary Schools: Teachers' Perspectives and Learning Challenges," *Proceedings Academic Universitas Jambi - PROCA UNJA 1* (2025): 1111-16, <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.22437/proca.v1i3.50593>.

³¹ Nuriyah, "Evaluasi Program Pembelajaran Bahasa Inggris Di Sekolah Dasar." <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.5773190>

³² Avdhikka Rayni Qomariah, Elin Driana, and Hari Setiadi, "Evaluation of the Implementation of English Medium Instruction," *Jurnal Penelitian Dan Evaluasi Pendidikan* 26, no. 1 (2022): 59-71, <https://doi.org/10.21831/pep.v26i1.45008>.

³³ Khoirun Nisaa Arnoi and Dwiyanto Djoko Pranowo, "English Learning Evaluation In Ef ' English First,'" *Jurnal Evaluasi Pendidikan* 11 (2020): 1-6, <https://doi.org/10.21009/JEP.0111.01>.

³⁴ Nuriyah, "Evaluasi Program Pembelajaran Bahasa Inggris Di Sekolah Dasar." <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.5773190>

general, participants experienced an increase in English proficiency according to their respective levels, which is in line with the program's objective of gradually improving language skills. However, because learning achievement standards have not been documented in detail, the evaluation of outcomes cannot be directly compared with standard competency indicators.

The absence of standard learning outcome documents means that the assessment process still depends on the tutor's interpretation of each semester's report cards. This condition does not indicate a critical problem, but it does indicate the need for improvement in the form of developing more structured achievement standards so that results can be measured more objectively, measurably, and consistently across all program levels.

Based on the overall comparison results, the gaps found are not fundamental and do not hinder program implementation. These gaps mainly include: (1) placement tests have been conducted but not in the form of formal documented procedures, (2) language laboratories are not available but have been replaced with the use of simple digital media, and (3) documentation of student learning progress still depends on semester report cards and is not yet compiled in a more detailed competency standard format.

These findings are an important basis for policy makers to determine future program development steps. Referring to the principles of the Discrepancy model, the right decision for the Al-Ghozali Islamic Boarding School English Class Program is not to discontinue or replace the program, but to continue it with modifications and improvements in technical and academic aspects. This program has demonstrated its effectiveness in achieving its main objectives, is relevant to the students' needs, and contributes positively to improving their English language skills. Therefore, strengthening the assessment system, developing learning media, and organizing competency documentation will further enhance the quality and effectiveness of the program in the future.

Conclusion

This study reveals that the English Class Program at Pondok Pesantren Al-Ghozali demonstrates a fundamentally strong design and implementation, particularly in its structured curriculum and communicative learning practices. However, several discrepancies remain evident, primarily related to the absence of standardized evaluation systems, limited documentation of learning outcomes, and inconsistencies in program implementation. These gaps indicate that while the program has been effectively executed in practice, its supporting evaluation and monitoring systems have not yet been fully optimized.

From a theoretical perspective, this study contributes to the development of program evaluation in Islamic boarding school contexts by demonstrating the applicability of the Discrepancy Evaluation Model (DEM) in analyzing language learning programs. Unlike previous studies that

primarily focus on instructional effectiveness, this research highlights how DEM provides a more comprehensive analytical framework by systematically examining the alignment between program design, implementation, and outcomes. The findings confirm that discrepancies in educational programs often occur not at the level of design, but within supporting systems such as evaluation, documentation, and implementation consistency.

Methodologically, this study offers an operational application of DEM by integrating its components—design, installation, process, product, and program comparison—into a structured qualitative evaluation framework. This approach enables a more nuanced understanding of program performance and provides a practical model for evaluating similar programs in Islamic educational institutions.

Practically, the findings suggest several strategic improvements for program development. First, it is necessary to establish standardized and well-documented evaluation frameworks, including clear learning outcome indicators for each level. Second, the implementation of systematic monitoring and supervision mechanisms is essential to ensure consistency in instructional practices. Third, the integration of technology-based learning tools should be further optimized to compensate for limited physical facilities. These steps are expected to enhance the overall quality, accountability, and sustainability of the program.

This study is not without limitations. The findings are based on a single case study within one Islamic boarding school, which may limit the generalizability of the results. In addition, the qualitative approach relies on participants' perspectives and available documentation, which may introduce subjective interpretation. Future research is recommended to expand the scope by incorporating multiple institutions, applying mixed-method approaches, and developing more standardized evaluation instruments for language programs in boarding school contexts.

In conclusion, this study underscores that the effectiveness of language learning programs is not solely determined by instructional design, but also by the presence of robust evaluation systems, systematic documentation, and consistent implementation. Strengthening these elements is essential to ensure that such programs can sustainably improve students' competencies and remain relevant in responding to global educational demands.

Bibliography

- Alizar, Mahfud, Tri Mulyanto, and Nuril Mufidah. "Manajemen Pengelolaan Lingkungan Berbahasa Arab Di Pondok Modern Daarul Abroor Banyuasin Sumatera Selatan." *Saliha: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Agama Islam* 6, no. 1 (2023): 61–78. <https://doi.org/10.54396/saliha.v6i1.470>
- Amalia, Arsyi Rizqia, Herlina Usman, Mohamad Syarif Sumantri, and Universitas Negeri Jakarta. "Analysis of the Use and Suitability of English Teaching Materials and Media in Elementary Schools:

- Teachers' Perspectives and Learning Challenges." *Proceedings Academic Universitas Jambi - PROCA UNJA* 1 (2025): 1111-16.
<https://doi.org/10.22437/proca.v1i3.50593>.
- Amaliyah, Yuli, and Panut Setiono. "The Implementation of Differentiated Learning Model for Primary School Students." *Jurnal Indonesia Pendidikan Profesi Guru* 1, no. 2 (2024): 73-80.
<https://ojs.aeducia.org/index.php/jippg>.
- Ananda, Eliza Putri. "Daya Minat Dalam Penggunaan Bahasa Inggris Dan Pengaruhnya Terhadap Komunikasi Masyarakat Indonesia." *HYPOTHESIS: Multidisciplinary Journal Of Social Sciences* 1, no. 02 Juni (2023): 172-84.
<https://azramedia-indonesia.azramediaindonesia.com/index.php/hypothesis/article/view/664>.
- Arnoi, Khoirun Nisaa, and Dwiyanto Djoko Pranowo. "English Learning Evaluation In Ef ' English First.'" *Jurnal Evaluasi Pendidikan* 11 (2020): 1-6. <https://doi.org/10.21009/JEP.0111.01>.
- Chodija, Intan Trine, Taufik Rahman, and Rendi Irmawanto. "Meningkatkan Kemampuan Berbicara Bahasa Inggris Melalui Metode Communicative Language Teacing Di Pondok Pesantren Roudlotul Quran Kota Metro." *Member: Jurnal Inovasi Pengabdian Masyarakat* 2 (2023): 9-17.
<https://doi.org/10.47902/member.v2i3.154>.
- EF Education First. "EF English Proficiency Index 2023," 2023.
https://www.ef.co.id/eipi/?utm_source.com.
- Etfita, Fauzul, Elinur, Yulianto, Arimuliani Ahmad, Alber, and Estika Satriani. "Pendampingan Pemanfaatan Mobile Assissted Language Learning (MALL) Untuk Meningkatkan Kemampuan Berbahasa Inggris." *Jurnal Abdidas* 6, no. 1 (2025): 97-106.
<https://doi.org/10.31004/abdidas.v6i1.1113>.
- Fenuku, Samson Dodzi. "The Core Aspects Ff Effective Language Pedagogy : Listening , Speaking , Writing and Reading." *Journal of English Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics* 10, no. 2 (2024): 132-54.
<https://doi.org/10.52657/js.v10i2.2345>.
- Hanafi, Wahyu, and Rizki Amalia Sholihah. "Politik Bahasa Asing Dan Hegemoni Pesantren Di Nusantara." *Journal of Arabic Language, Literature, and Education* 1, no. 1 (2020): 43-53.
<https://doi.org/10.37680/aphorisme.v1i1.320>.
- Husna, Ema Umiatul, Muhammad Anshori, and Khoirun Nisa'. "Strategi Pembelajaran Program Bahasa Arab Dan Bahasa Inggris Untuk Meningkatkan Daya Saing Alumni Di Era Revolusi Industri 4.0 Di Pondok Pesantren Mamba'us Sholihin Suci Manyar Gresik." *JoEMS (Journal of Education and Management Studies)* 4, no. 1 (2021): 51-58.
<https://doi.org/10.32764/joems.v4i1.355>.
- Kholid, Nur, Doni Sastrawan, and Fuad Buntoro. "Problematika Interaksi Siswa Dalam Penggunaan Bahasa Arab Dan Inggris Di Pondok

- Pesantren." *JRPP: Jurnal Review Pendidikan Dan Pengajaran* 6, no. 4 (2023): 8–13. <https://doi.org/10.31004/jrpp.v6i4.19028>
- Leong, Lai-mei, and Seyedeh Masoumeh Ahmadi. "An Analysis of Factors Influencing Learners' English Speaking Skill." *International Journal of Research in English Education*, 2017, 34–41. <https://doi.org/10.18869/acadpub.ijree.2.1.34>.
- Lestari, Putri Zulfa, Rijal Amirulloh, and Dine Meigawati. "The Implementation of a Competency-Based Training Program at the Regional Technical Implementation Unit of the Job Training Center Dinas Tenaga Kerja Dan Transmigrasi Sukabumi Regency." *International Conference on Economics, Technology, Management, Accounting, Education, and Social Science* 01 (2025): 681–90. <https://conference.unita.ac.id/index.php/icetea/article/view/411>.
- Martínez, Julio Antonio Álvarez, Juan Fernando Gómez, and Juan Carlos Restrepo Botero. "Mobile-Assisted Language Learning (MALL) for Improving English Language Teaching and Learning in Higher Education : A Systematic Literature Review." *Knowledge Management & E-Learning: An International Journal (KM&EL)* 17, no. 2 (2025): 258–77. <https://doi.org/10.34105/j.kmel.2025.17.012>.
- Morgan, Hani. "Using Triangulation and Crystallization to Make Qualitative Studies Trustworthy and Rigorous." *Qualitative Report* 29, no. 7 (2024): 1844–56. <https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2024.6071>.
- Nugrahani, Irene Septinna, and Yari Dwikurnaningsih. "Primary :Evaluating Teacher Performance in Implementing Differentiated Learning Using the Discrepancy Model." *Primary : Jurnal Pendidikan Guru Sekolah Dasar* 14, no. 3 (2025): 344–54. <https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.33578/jpfkip.v14i3.p344-354>
[Evaluating.](#)
- Nurhadi, Andika Rachman, Kingkin Wardaya, and Lilis Lisda. "Evaluasi Program Ekstrakurikuler Pramuka (Studi Evaluasi Discrepancy Evaluation Model Di Sekolah Menengah Pertama Islam Nurul Fikri Boarding School Serang)." *Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam* 4, no. 1 (2024): 27–50. <https://jurnal.staiq.ac.id/index.php/elmadrasa/article/view/86>.
- Nuriyah, Laely. "Evaluasi Program Pembelajaran Bahasa Inggris Di Sekolah Dasar." *Jurnal Ilmiah Wahana Pendidikan* 7, no. 8 (2021): 397–405. <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.5773190>.
- Nursa'ban, Muhammad, and Mukminan. "The Implementation of Geography Learning with Spatial Representation Using the Discrepancy Evaluation Model." *REID (Research and Evaluation in Education)* 9, no. 1 (2023): 49–64. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.21831/reid.v9i1.53505>.
- Putri, Kharisma, and Elizar. "Implementing a Differentiation Approach in Teaching to Accommodate Diverse Learning Styles Of Primary School

- Students: A Systematic Literature Review." *Journal for Lesson and Learning Studies* 8, no. 1 (2025): 119–28. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jlls.v8i1.89659>.
- Qomariah, Avdhikka Rayni, Elin Driana, and Hari Setiadi. "Evaluation of the Implementation of English Medium Instruction." *Jurnal Penelitian Dan Evaluasi Pendidikan* 26, no. 1 (2022): 59–71. <https://doi.org/10.21831/pep.v26i1.45008>.
- Rahman, Aqilah Salsabila, Sekolah Islam Athirah, Discrepancy Evaluation Model, Indeks Kepuasan Pelanggan, and Sekolah Islam Athirah. "Evaluasi Pelaksanaan Program Bilingual Class SMP Islam Athirah." *Jurnal Pengabdian Masyarakat Bakti Negeri* 2, no. 1 (2025): 38–48. <https://doi.org/10.71277/rd613x86>.
- Raj, Antony, and Prajeesh Tomy. "An Experimental Study on the Influence of Instructional Mobile Applications in Enhancing Listening Comprehension of Rural Students in India." *Frontiers in Education* 8 (2024): 1–13. <https://doi.org/10.3389/feduc.2023.1280868>.
- Safitri, Dhamar Widya, and Edi Istiyono. "The Impacts of Zoning System Policies of New Students' Admission on the Education Quality Equalization." *Journal of Educational Research and Evaluation* 6, no. 3 (2022): 619–28. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jere.v6i4.52712>.
- Sari, Maria Puspa. "An Evaluation of English Program: A Deep Analysis of Efl Learners' Attitude Towards English Program." *International Journal of Indonesian Education and Teaching* 5, no. 2 (2021): 133–47. <https://doi.org/10.24071/ijiet.v5i2.3245>.
- Setiyorini, Tri Jampi, Yuyun Yulia, and Hasti Robiasih. "Communicative Language Teaching Method at Improving Students' Macro and Micro-Skills of Reading Comprehension in Intensive Reading Course." *EduLite: Journal of English Education, Literature and Culture* 7 (2022): 233–50. <https://dx.doi.org/10.30659/e.7.2.233-250>.
- Subasno, Yohanes. "Provus's Discrepancy Evaluation Model Pada Pendidikan Inklusi." *Jurnal Kataketik Dan Patoral* 3 (2018): 23–34. https://e-journal.stp-ipi.ac.id/index.php/sapa/article/view/53?utm_source.com.
- Sugiyono. *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, Dan RND*. Bandung: Alfabeta, 2017.
- Wandasari, Hestia, Asma Syafiqo Loekman, Arsyrahma Eka Pratiwi, Nur Indah, Lestari Kusuma, Pendidikan Masyarakat, Universitas Siliwangi, et al. "Evaluasi Program Kesetaraan Paket C Berbasis Model Provus Di PKBM Budi Utama." *Cendekia: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pemberdayaan Masyarakat* 2, no. 2 (2024). <https://journal.bayfapublisher.com/index.php/cendekia/article/view/68>.
- Zahroh, Fitri Lutfia, and Fitri Hilmiyati. "Indikator Keberhasilan Dalam Evaluasi Program Pendidikan." *Edu Cendekia: Jurnal Ilmiah Kependidikan*

- 4 (2024): 1052–63. <https://doi.org/10.47709/educendikia.v4i03>.
- Zainollah, and Ali Ridho. "Pendidikan Bahasa Asing Di Pondok Pesantren Mambaul Ulum Bata-Bata Pamekasan." *Kariman: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Keislaman* 09, no. Juni (2021): 85–102. <https://www.jurnalinkadha.org/index.php/kariman/article/view/172>.